Environment & Society Portal

Multimedia Library Collection: Environmental Values (journal)

"Convergence, Noninstrumental Value and the Semantics of 'Love': Comment on McShane"

Norton, Bryan G.

Norton, Bryan G. "Convergence, Noninstrumental Value and the Semantics of 'Love': Comment on McShane." *Environmental Values* 17, no. 1 (2008): 5–4. doi:10.3197/096327108X271914 .

Katie McShane, while accepting my "convergence hypothesis" (the view that anthropocentrists and nonanthropocentrists will tend to propose similar policies), argues that nonanthropocentrism is nevertheless superior because it allows conservationists to have a deeper emotional commitment to natural objects than can anthropocentrists. I question this reasoning on two bases. First, McShane assumes a philosophically tendentious distinction between intrinsic and instrumental value—a distinction that presupposes a dualistic worldview. Second, I question why McShane believes anthropocentrists—weak anthropocentrists, that is—cannot "love" or "feel awe" toward natural objects. Her argument, that is, only works against strong anthropocentrism, which I never advocated.
— Text from The White Horse Press website

All rights reserved. © 2008 The White Horse Press

Download:
PDF: https://www.environmentandsociety.org/sites/default/files/key_docs/ev_17no.2_norton_bryan_g.pdf

Related links:

- Article on the official website
  http://www.erica.demon.co.uk/EV/EV1701.html
- The White Horse Press
  http://www.erica.demon.co.uk/

Websites linked in this text:

Environmental Values (journal) Collection, Multimedia Library, Environment & Society Portal
"Convergence, Noninstrumental Value and the Semantics of 'Love': Comment on McShane"
Source URL: http://www.environmentandsociety.org/node/6020
Print date: 07 November 2026 04:55:21

- http://dx.doi.org/10.3197/096327108X271914
- http://www.erica.demon.co.uk/EV/EV1701.html

Environmental Values (journal) Collection, Multimedia Library, Environment & Society Portal
"Convergence, Noninstrumental Value and the Semantics of 'Love': Comment on McShane"
Source URL: http://www.environmentandsociety.org/node/6020
Print date: 07 November 2026 04:55:21